

Proving properties of imperative programs – “Hoare logic”

- Judgments, a.k.a. “Hoare formulas”
- Axioms
- Rules of inference

$$\underline{\eta, e_1 \Downarrow \langle \text{fun } x \rightarrow e, \eta' \rangle} \quad \eta, e_2 \Downarrow v \quad \eta'[x \rightarrow v], e \Downarrow v'$$

η, e_1, e_2 ✓
 $\text{let } g =$
 $\text{let in let } b = \dots \text{ in fun } \dots$

 $\text{let } f = \text{fun } x \rightarrow 3$
 $\text{in } (f 1, f \text{ true})$

 $\text{let } f = \text{fun } \dots$
 $\text{in } \dots$
 $\text{fun } f \rightarrow (f 1, f \text{ true})$
 $(\text{fun } x \rightarrow 3)$
 \times
 $\text{fun } f \rightarrow (f 1, f \text{ true})$
 $(\text{fun } x \rightarrow 3)$

Correctness of imperative programs

- “Hoare formula” says that if the variables in a program satisfy some properties, then after executing a given program, they satisfy some different properties.

- Examples:

$$x > 0 \{ \text{while } (x > 0) \\ \{y := y^*x; x := x - 1;\} \} \quad y = y^*x!$$
$$x = x_0 \& y = y_0 \{ t := x; x := y; y := t \} \\ x = y_0 \& y = x_0$$

true { if (x<0) x := -x; } x = |x|

true { n := length(a); b := [hd a];

a := tl a;

while (a != []) {

b := (hd a + hd b) :: b;

a := tl a; }

} $b_i = \sum_{k=0}^{n-i-1} a_k$ (where $b_i = \text{hd}(\text{tl}^i b)$,
and similarly for a_k)

Inference rules of Hoare logic

Judgments: $P \{S\} Q$ ✓

P, Q assertions about variables in the program

S a statement in this language:

Stmt \rightarrow Var := Expr | Stmt; Stmt
| if (Expr) then Stmt else Stmt
| while (Expr) Stmt

Inference rules of Hoare logic

$$\frac{\text{P[e/x] } \{x := e\} \text{ P} \quad \begin{array}{c} (\text{Axiom}) \\ | \\ \text{P} \& b \{S\} \text{ P} \end{array}}{\text{P} \{\text{while (b) S}\} \text{ P} \& \neg b}$$
$$\frac{\text{P } \{S_1\} \text{ Q} \quad \text{Q } \{S_2\} \text{ R}}{\text{P } \{S_1; S_2\} \text{ R}}$$

$$\frac{\text{P} \Rightarrow \text{P}' \quad \text{P}' \{S\} \text{ Q}' \quad \text{Q}' \Rightarrow \text{Q}}{\text{P } \{S\} \text{ Q}}$$

$$\frac{\text{P} \& b \{S_1\} \text{ Q} \quad \text{P} \& \neg b \{S_2\} \text{ Q}}{\text{P } \{\text{if (b) then } S_1 \text{ else } S_2\} \text{ Q}}$$

Rule of assignment:

$$\frac{}{P[e/x] \{x := \underline{e}\} P}$$

$$x+1=2 \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{l} x := x + 1 \\ \end{array} \right\} \quad x = 2$$

$$y=2 \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{l} x := y \\ \end{array} \right\} \quad x = 2$$

Examples

$y=2 \{ x:=y \} \quad x=2$

$y=2 \{ x:=2 \} \quad y=x$

$x+1=n+1 \quad \{ x:=x+1 \} \quad x=n+1$

$x+1=n \quad \{ x:=x+1 \} \quad x=n$

~~tree $\{ x:=2 \} \quad x=2$~~ ?

$x=n \quad \{ x:=x+1 \} \quad x=n+1$

Rule of consequence

$$\frac{P \Rightarrow P' \quad P' \{S\} Q' \quad Q' \Rightarrow Q}{P \{S\} Q}$$

$\overbrace{\begin{array}{c} P \\ \cancel{x=n} \\ \Rightarrow \cancel{x+1=n+1} \end{array}}^P' \quad \overbrace{\begin{array}{c} x+1=n+1 \\ P' \end{array}}^P' \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{c} x:=x+1 \\ S \end{array} \right\} \quad \overbrace{\begin{array}{c} x=n+1 \\ Q' \end{array}}^{Q'} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{(Ass. gr.)} \\ \cancel{x=n+1} \\ \Rightarrow \cancel{x+1=n+1} \end{array} \quad \overbrace{\begin{array}{c} Q' \\ Q \end{array}}^Q$

$\underbrace{x=n}_P \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{c} x:=x+1 \\ S \end{array} \right\} \quad \underbrace{x=n+1}_Q$

Sequence rule

$$\frac{P\{S_1\} Q \quad Q\{S_2\} R}{P\{S_1; S_2\} R}$$

?

?

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} t=x_0 \\ x=y_0 \\ \hline \end{array} \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{l} x:=y \\ x=y_0 \end{array} \right\} \quad \begin{array}{c} t=x_0 \\ x=y_0 \\ \hline \end{array}}{\begin{array}{c} t=x_0 \\ x=y_0 \\ \hline \end{array} \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{l} y=t \\ y=y_0 \end{array} \right\} \quad \begin{array}{c} x=y_0 \\ y=x_0 \\ \hline \end{array}}$$

?

$$\frac{x=x_0 \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{l} t:=x \\ x=x_0 \end{array} \right\} \quad \begin{array}{c} t=x_0 \\ x=y_0 \\ \hline \end{array}}{x=x_0 \quad y=y_0 \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{l} t:=x; x=y; y=t \end{array} \right\}}$$

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} t=x_0 \\ x=y_0 \\ \hline \end{array} \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{l} x=y; y=t \\ y=x_0 \end{array} \right\} \quad \begin{array}{c} x=y_0 \\ y=x_0 \\ \hline \end{array}}{x=y_0 \quad y=x_0}$$

$$x=x_0 \quad y=y_0 \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{l} t:=x; x=y; y=t \end{array} \right\} \quad x=y_0 \quad y=x_0$$

If rule

$$\frac{P \& b \{S_1\} Q \quad P \& \neg b \{S_2\} Q}{P \{\text{if } (b) \text{ then } S_1 \text{ else } S_2\} Q}$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\text{Asygn} \quad \frac{\overline{\{x := -x\}} \quad \Rightarrow}{x = x_0 \quad \{x := -x\} \quad x = |x_0| \quad \& \quad x < 0}}{\frac{\text{Assygn} \quad \frac{- \quad \{x = x\} \quad -}{x = x_0 \quad \{x := x\} \quad x = |x_0| \quad \& \quad x \neq 0}}{x = x_0 \quad \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{if } x < 0 \\ \text{then } x := -x \\ \text{else } x := x \end{array} \right\} \quad x = |x_0|}}$$

While rule

$$\frac{P \& b \{S\} P}{P \{\text{while } (b) S\} P \& \neg b}$$

$$\boxed{s=0}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{while } (i < n) \{ \\ & \quad s := s + i; \\ & \quad i := i + 1 \} \quad \text{Invariant:} \\ & \Rightarrow s = \sum_{j=0}^{i-1} j \quad \& \quad i = n \end{aligned}$$

Comments on Hoare logic

- Proofs in Hoare logic are *almost* syntax-directed, i.e. almost have the same shape as the program being proved. The only exceptions are the uses of the rule of consequence.
- Applying Hoare rules is largely mechanical – given A and Q, most of the proof (including P) can be generated automatically. Creativity is required mainly in determining the invariant in a while loop, because Q may not have the form “ $P \ \& \ \neg b$ ”, and so a formula of that form needs to be found (after which the rule of consequence can be used, proving $P \ \& \ \neg b \Rightarrow Q$).

Example: gcd algorithm

```
a > 0 & b > 0 & a=a0 & b=b0 {  
    while (a ≠ b)  
        if (a > b) then a := a – b;  
        else b := b – a;  
}  a = gcd(a0, b0)
```